

Wellington Migliari
University of Barcelona

SÃO PAULO, WARSAW AND LANDLOCKED AREAS: FROM FUNCTIONALITY TO PROTO-RIGHT TO THE CITY

1. SÃO PAULO, WARSAW AND GLOBAL CITIES

The centre and periphery infrastructure relies on socioeconomic exclusion. The fashion it is provided determines ghettos, *favelas* and suburbs. There is also an element of labour division since the outskirts aggregate unskilled work force and low salaries. The desire for city life participation is more evident if participative democratic actions are analysed not only concerning institutional parameters such as elections for parliamentary representatives. In the present article, the concept of proto refers to massive people's engagement in city issues and how these individuals are politically committed to promote more transformative spaces in urban context. They aspire to be heard in different demands such as housing, civil rights, free-tickets for students or even more fiscal transparency in public revenues. However, they are not yet considered the representatives of what Henri Lefebvre's ideas suggested as the right to the city, because the French philosopher's concept is linked to an organised working-class, binding nuclei in decision making-processes evolving urban policies in collective boards coordinated by local public administrations and a critical consciousness on property rights using the notion of exchange value from a Marxist perspective¹. In São Paulo, for example, many urban social movements started their activities asking for more rights in a diffuse demand. All of them have used the words "rights", "social" and "State". They allude or refer literally to concepts not necessarily originated by the juridical *status quo*. The entries "collectives", "justice" and "civil partnership" are emblematic. It is interesting how some of the semantics and phrases can be practically intercalated in the municipal agenda. The housing rights claimants usually sing the jingle "Let's create the popular power" and call the attention to

¹ M. Purcell, *Excavating Lefebvre: the right to the city and its urban politics of the inhabitant*, GeoJournal 2002, No. 58, p. 103.

the fact they are fighting for social justice through housing issues². The housing right claimers also promote more transparency, questioning prices, project places and public-private strategies to build entire neighbourhoods. They used “We are many, we are in every occupation” in 1997.

The homo, bi and transsexual movements are other examples of communities. In 1998 and 2005, they said “The rights of gays, lesbians and transvestites are human rights” and “Civil partnership now. Equal rights! Neither more nor less” respectively³. A less dogmatic reading about these urban social movements, i.e., not strictly linking them to unionism as a *cliché* overview, reveals historically a semantic agenda for more rights and occupied urban spaces to say so. Yet, it seems to be a response of our post-Cold War political life with particular cases such as May 1968 in Paris or 1960s-1970s Washington protests against the Vietnam War, people have been more in the public eye claiming for their rights that we imagine. In 1832, Londoners decided to hold a one-month general strike or simply the “holiday” as they demanded: “During this ‘holiday’ period, working-class representatives would draw up a constitution to ‘place every human being on the same footing. Equal rights, equal enjoyments, equal toil, equal respect, equal share of production’”⁴. Although workers clearly feel the lack of effective rights, mainly the unskilled who suffer more with capital changes, they know that the urban space is the place where they have to act if they want to be heard. David Harvey and other authors point out the importance of being attentive to demands linked to rights during 1848 in order to avoid any naturalisation between workers and syndicalism. He recapitulates that the industrial working-class in the urban space was not strictly part of the Paris Commune experience: “There is, for this reason, a dissident and influential view of the Commune that says it was not a proletarian uprising or a class-based movement at all, but an urban social movement that was reclaiming citizenship rights and the right to the city. It was not, therefore, capitalist”⁵.

Warsaw is not only the capital of Poland. It is also part of its long, rich and resilient history. Sometimes the city is remembered by its famous composer Fryderyk

² R. Rolnik, *Afterword – Place, inhabitation and citizenship: the right to housing and the right to the city in the contemporary urban world*, International Journal of Housing Policy 2014, No. 3 (14), pp. 293–300.

³ About the right to housing, look for the social organisations Movimento dos Trabalhadores Sem-Teto (MTST), Frente de Luta por Moradia (FLM) and União dos Movimentos de Moradia (UMM). With reference to free tickets for students and against the continuous increasing ticket prices, Movimento Passe-Livre (MPL). For equal civil rights, check the Associação da Parada do Orgulho de Gays, Lésbicas, Bissexuais e Transexuais (LGBT).

⁴ D. Rosenberd, *Rebel Footprints: A Guide to Uncovering London’s Radical History*, London 2015, p. 23.

⁵ D. Harvey, *Rebel Cities: from the Right to the City to the Urban Revolution*, London 2012, pp. 128–132 and M. L. Souza, *Which right to which city?, In defence of political-strategic clarity*, Interface: a journal for and about social movements 2010, No. 1 (2), pp. 315–333.

Franciszek Chopin (1810–1849), Pope John Paul II and the devastating German World War II attack that completely destroyed the downtown while the Russian troops watched inertly the devastation. The Warsaw ghetto is also remembered as city resistance, but also unfortunately for a complete massacre of the Jewish community and without a shadow of doubt a genocidal action. Warsaw is a phoenix and the Polish have such positive capacity in constructing and re-constructing. Its countryside is remembered by K. Marx and Friedrich Engels in their *Communist Manifesto*: “In Poland, they [the Communists] support the party that insists on an agrarian revolution as the prime condition for national emancipation, that party which fomented the insurrection of Cracow in 1846”⁶. At that time, there was already a consensus for the peasants that historical and economic possibilities forced them to a dependent status. The production was more and more integrated in an international demand and supply chain.

Meanwhile, conservative and leftists disputed the political scenario in 1863, however, none of them knew the next step after assuming the power: “The Polish struggle between 1815–1863 was not only to determine who should rule at home, when independence had been won, but also to decide how Poland should be organized for the future”. R. F. Leslie also tells us about the nationalist sentiment of enterprise in Poland during the 1840s. The Organic Work was an attempt to promote political stability through commercial and industrial activity. Mainly skilled labourers were invited to cooperate under the name of Poland and this was an alternative to inhibit until the disarticulation of insurrection or any kind of revolution. The occupation of the city by the working class depended on an alliance with the peasantry. That coalition revealed the consciousness of the poorest urban inhabitants that the space of the city should be occupied by a country-city united contestation. It was the strategy the unskilled labourers used in order to resist all forms of an economic plan for the nationalist petty bourgeoisie, industrialists and land owners⁷. Production, property and class struggles were in question. Around fifty years later, the Russian Revolution had begun and erupted in 1917. It was decisive to reorganise the forms of production through a political regime based on the idea of the commons, but unfortunately was not followed by a serious project having individual liberty as a quintessential piece of a pluralist society.

⁶ It must be said that the *Communist Manifesto* (1850) is generally reduced to a very misleading overview of anti-pluralistic experiences since the first Industrial Revolution in 1750. It was not a dogmatic document oppressing dissident perspectives about labour, individual liberties and economic programmes. Karl Marx and Friedrich Engels had clear the labour organisation should be based on tolerance and pluralism in many aspects. In France, for example, the communions or the Communists allied with the Social-Democrats to combat the conservative and radical bourgeoisie; in Switzerland, they ally with the Radicals; in Poland, they support the party linked to agrarian revolution; in Germany, they are with the bourgeoisie to fight against the absolute monarchy, feudal squirearchy and petty bourgeoisie. See R. Alan, *The Communist Manifesto*, (in:) A. Ryan, *On Marx*, London 2014, pp. 195–196.

⁷ R. F. Leslie, *The History of Poland since 1863*, Cambridge 1980, pp. 3–7.

Joseph Stalin (1878–1953) took office in the mid-1920s after defeating internally Vladimir Lenin (1870–1924) and Leon Trotsky (1979–1940). He remained as a leader of the Russian Communist Party until 1953 while Poland continued being dominated by the Soviets till 1989 when the Berlin Wall fell down.

The Polish history is so rich and full of details, but the claims for more rights for both working class in urban contexts and peasantry are still alive, yet with more internationalised symbols and consumerist dreams. Today, a long-historical centre-periphery logic leads us not only to a time of effervescent political clashes about voting and future rulers, but mainly the desire of people in taking part in the decision-making process for the whole country. In December 2011, activists and citizens stood for a milk bar to avoid the transformation of the place into a sophisticated and expensive restaurant. They stood for the old Socialist place in *Śródmieście*, which means in Polish “downtown”, as a way to evoke emblematic and semantic strength in city issues. The unconscious wish for transformative platforms with collective participation clash with the urban plutocracy deciding the city. The city administration was taking into consideration the closure of a bar in order to open a fine restaurant. It was not in question whether they could pay or not for the renovated place: “(...) activists and citizens from the Central District (*Śródmieście*) barricaded themselves in old socialist milk bar to prevent this extremely popular cheap food venue from being closed down and redesigned as an expensive restaurant (...) the tent town ‘Occupy Warsaw’ in the city center, co-organized by the tenants’ rights movement among other, demands with a huge banner the “Right to the City”⁸.

At first, Occupy Wall Street may be seen as a complex movement demanding responsibility of bankers and accusing the financial system of being frivolous in managing the economy. The presence of people in the public eye questioning economic powers through property transformation is not new. As mentioned, the Londoners in 1832 and the Paris Commune in 1848 are examples of organised individuals fighting for more rights while one of the variables of accumulation of money was linked to property issues. If any legislation existed protecting collectives at that time, they were not effective to meet people’s political dissatisfaction. This is why we call the attention of these events as historical facts related to different kinds of criticism about the decision-making process. London and Paris had citizens unhappy with the models of representation in formal democracy in which they were allowed to take part just in periods of election, but they could not give their opinions. The claim for rights or the discourse of injustice clash the entire mode of what, how, when, where and for whom the society is produced. Global cities and urban issues are very sensitive to forms of exclusivist decision-making processes. Despite the myriad of demands popping up all over the world and in

⁸ M. Grubbauer, J. Kusiak (eds.), *Chasing Warsaw: Social Material Dynamics of Urban Change Since 1990*, Frankfurt 2012, p. 13.

different urban realities since 2011, the recurring theme has to do with economic and tax changes under non-participative models of representation. The more centralised the making of urban policies to run city developments and redistribution of income, the more conflictive situations. If markets fail in offering options to every citizen under moments of capital crisis, the political demanding variable may appear: “By October, protesters in almost every state had joined in, and demonstrations had jumped both oceans to Hong Kong, Madrid, Tokyo, Frankfurt and Sydney. Occupy was now in hundreds of cities. Crowds gathered in Los Angeles, Albuquerque, Toledo, Knoxville and Fairbanks. Some rallies brought out only a few dozen some thousands”⁹. Our rationale is that models of suburbanisation produce dramatic inequalities in urban context and it can be analysed as one of the city products originating from very restrictive decision-making processes. The cases of São Paulo and Warsaw are not a coincidence, but a repetition of economically geographical centre-periphery logic. So, occupy movements are some of those political strategies to question segregationist urban policies.

2. CITY FUNCTIONALITY AND EXCLUSION IN URBAN POLICIES

The concept of functionality refers to city models that serve the movements of the capital in increasing the marginal returns for investors till the zenith they judge convenient. So highways, means of transportation, cables of electricity, sewage pipelines, litter to be collected, natural gas, water supply, subway, public security and commercial centres are understood as products. The use value of such public services is converted into exchange value of a selective urban plan-

⁹ M. Scherer, *Introduction: Taking it to the Streets*, (in:) *What is Occupy? Inside the Global Movement*, New York 2011, p. 6. We understand the concept of citizen as a person who lives in a city under civic and basic economic rights. It has nothing to do with legal, residential and papered status stated by immigrant authorities. In U.S., Spain and many other countries in Europe you do not necessarily have to be a legal immigrant to have a saving account and access to basic services. Immigrant Law Group PC gives support for those in need in United States as the internet page of the office affirms at <http://bit.ly/1IVBvbb>. In 2011, as a special Time edition reported: “Across the U.S., financial and political frustration has spawned a rush of petitions to effect change at a time when Americans have lost confidence in Congress to get the job done. Katchpole’s campaign wasn’t the first to take on Bank of America, which under the Change.org spotlight in the summer of 2011 when a Seattle woman won her fight to keep the bank from foreclosing on her home. Foreclosure petitions were one of two trends Change.org noticed on its site that year. Dozens of students have their deportation cancelled as friends and family used the platform to bring attention to their situation. After Katchpole’s campaign, more than 30 copycat petitions demanded that banks, including Citibank and SunTrust, change their fee plans. Nearly half have already won”. See E. Dias, *The Citizen who Stood Up to the Bankers*, (in:) *What is Occupy? Inside the Global Movement*, New York 2011, p. 74.

ning project. It is not a secret the investors of the housing market will be engaged in those enterprises in which their profits satisfy their wishes. In the same line of production, public policy makers believe cities must be financially inspiring for investors. As a consequence the concept of functionality combines two more variables, i.e., the urban infrastructure for space and the public debt. Yet under legislation and budgetary responsibility discourse, such amalgamation has apparent short-term positive effects, but in the long run, lawful action for indebtedness produces negative externalities. This is a risky element related to contingency, but not inserted in the cases of emerging countries in a strategic plan for social economic development. Investors stay if the enterprise is profitable. The society as a whole assumes the financial risk and high interests, the urban investors the assets. The city policy makers put forward a political agenda much more linked to the rapid transformation of the space without any connection to future economic burdens.

2.1. PERIPHERY, FUNCTIONAL LANDLOCKED AREAS AND SÃO PAULO'S OUTER RINGS

The nonexistence of natural boundaries or limits partially explains the urban development model of São Paulo metropolitan area. The municipality appeared originally as a small village that was founded by Catholic catechisers in 1554. In the 1860s, the municipality grew and its economy prospered with coffee plantations. In the beginning of the XX, the *Belle Époque* city was divided in two main areas. The downtown was the place where there was a commercial petty bourgeoisie and up the hill along Paulista Avenue was the wealthy boulevard with well-done coffee farmers' mansions. Brás, Bexiga and Barra Funda were the first poor working-class neighbourhoods in the periphery of São Paulo. These new zones were respectively located in the east, south and west parts. The white immigrants could only afford tenement houses. Black people made free from the 1888 Abolition Act used to live in yet more run-down and overcrowded zones such as Paissandu Square and along Nove de Julho Avenue. Today, we can affirm that the centre-periphery logic in São Paulo was originated in the first years of the First Brazilian Republic (1889–1930).

The 1922 Modern Art Week or *Semana de Arte Moderna de 1922* may be interpreted as a seminal synthesis of all projects in music, painting, literature and sculpture inspired by São Paulo, its convulsive modernisation and a myriad of possibilities in changing the Brazilian reality with an industrial era being introduced to the country. A project of modernisation started being imported to Brazil and enthusiastically seen by many artists as the time for national development. Two names were very attentive to the vibrant forces of organised work, technology and progress bound up with traditional roots. Mario de Andrade (1893–1945), the novelist of Macunaíma; and the composer of *Bachianas Brasileiras*, Heitor

Villa-Lobos (1887–1959) were fascinated with the idea of mixing the Brazilian folklore with universal values in non-dogmatic aesthetics learnt in neoclassical academies of art. Tarsila do Amaral (1886–1973), who could translate clearly a kind of distrust in her paintings with reference to Brazilian modernisation in the beginning of the XX, did the same. She seemed to be hesitating about the image of new urban space and it is possible to apprehend such challenging overview in how she melancholily represented the urban space, its centre-periphery and labourers. Paintings pointing the “Morro da Favela” (1924), “La Gare” and “Operários” (1925)¹⁰ introduce sequentially the ideological functional division of what was about to be modernisation, i.e., *favela*, “train or tram” and “reified labourers”.

Dominated by the coffee elites, the beginning of the XX century was promising for those parts of the city housing the wealthiest. Upper middle classes with their small fortune could take advantages of the urban transformation in São Paulo as well. Investments in infrastructure were the way to transform a timid and historically tiny village into a potential urbanised city with cobbled streets, electricity and running water at home. The constructions of the Municipal Theatre and the Anhangabaú Valley were decisive as the public interventions to provide for public lights in the city. All these facilities and innovations were financed by coffee barony and naturally serving their own needs, industrialists and shop owners. The *Belle Époque* style became also the cultural standard of the city, but at the same time a social grammar for an exclusivist, glamorous and elitist space. Moreover, neoclassical buildings in the city centre, the modernist values and the streets contrasted with the old Portuguese architecture known as *casa-grande* where private life was devoted to rural areas and isolation¹¹. The means of transportation imported by the wealthy, such as Wanderer motorcycles and Overland cars, started being part of a geographically delimited city. The centre-periphery infrastructure model was implanted since the city was understood as a product not for all. Such urban model still persists¹². As an example of past presence, the mayor of São Paulo, Fernando Haddad (Labour Party), presented a project during his 2012 campaign with the idea of creating a road belt linking giant neighbourhoods in order to promote more physical integration. He wanted to connect existent highways and complete a semi-circumference of the 22 million people metropolis making possible an approximate speed of 30 miles per hour. The first

¹⁰ We freely translate the three paintings as “Favela Hill”, “The Train Station” and “Factory Workers”.

¹¹ G. Freyre, *Sobrados e Mucambos*, São Paulo 2003, pp. 134–175.

¹² S. P. Taschner, L. M. Bogus, *São Paulo: o caleidoscópio urbano*, São Paulo Perspectiva 2001, Vol. 15, No. 1, pp. 31–44 and L. C. Pessoa, L. Bogus, *Operações urbanas – nova forma de incorporação imobiliária: o caso das Operações Urbanas Consorciadas Faria Lima e Água Espraiada*, Cadernos Metrôpole 2008, No. 20, pp. 125–139.

year he took office the linkage was aborted. It seems to be difficult to unite a city that has been ideologically internalised as an object of separation for its citizens¹³.

Another aspect of this linkage is the level of salary. The economic matter evolving income is intimately connected to the access to formal urbanism. If lower-working class people become integrated they will desire the same for them as they see in formal richer zones. We use the idea of formality in urban topics to define those areas where the public budget applied corresponds to infrastructural urban policies based on middle and upper middle classes demands, but it does not match with the space standards in the periphery. Paved roads, tunnels, bridges, parks, underground stations, flexibility in legislation for skyscrapers construction, parking lots, commercial centres and public safety are hard issues for the richest in the metropolis, but they have the option whether using that infrastructural offer or not. On the other hand, in those areas outside the formal ring, basic public services are not sufficient, sanitary conditions precarious and the means of transportation scarcely covering comfortably the need of the poor. Moreover, the public safety is an issue in the periphery and most of the time criminal actions in the municipality have the State of São Paulo police present. Public health and educational services are theoretically offered for free, but the quality is poor. The higher the wage average inside the ring, the more we can find formal designs of urban public policies and private services. Economic variables determine who can either pay for the formal city or who cannot. It is a micro-version of a land-locked area, but with the same idea of security guards, cameras, private parking underneath, swimming pools, gym, playground and party premises¹⁴.

The inner-lands with an immense geographical relatively flat area was the object of private enterprise. The urban developer *City of São Paulo Improvements and Freehold Land Company Limited*, which was represented by two English urbanists called Barry Parker and Raymond Unwin, bought an immense area near the Pinheiros River and Butantan Institute. The project was designed to be an upper class suburb not far from the centre of São Paulo. Jardim América, Pacaembu, Alto de Pinheiros e Butantã are some of the neighbourhoods created for a determined socioeconomic rank of the Paulistana society. The profits of the *City of São Paulo Improvements* were attractive and the inaction of the municipal power converged on a zone to serve property investment, roads for cars and prestige. Environmental issues, electricity and sewage were not part of the plan as a whole and the matrix of São Paulo started being designed with highly selective housing projects. The economic progress and relatively formal urban planning for some represented less funds for other neighbourhoods once São Paulo Municipality had to subsidise all infrastructure to link the new suburbs to the old downtown,

¹³ See <http://www.antp.org.br/noticias/clippings/sem-recursos-gestao-haddad-desiste-de-pacote-viario-do-arco-do-futuro.html>.

¹⁴ See http://infocidade.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/mapas/9_distribuicao_das_favelas_2014_10251.pdf.

Paulista Avenue and attract the investors. It was a round table negotiation at which few were invited to sit. They were not really landlocked areas with walls as we see in Barueri and Morumbi today, but the infrastructure and prices for products or services prevent the wealthy families from the presence of poor neighbourhoods.

Some neighbourhoods were born in the city after intense private investments almost without public urban planning. During the 1960s, housing developers bought parts of an old farm land dividing it into plots. Near the Pinheiros and the Tietê River, a new extension of the municipality was urbanised and at the same time isolated by scarce services of public transportation. In the surrounding that area, we find the Jockey Club inaugurated in 1875. Since the inhabitants of these new suburbs had private means of transportation, the access was restricted and also expensive for the working class. The zone has always been symbolically under dispute. In 2004, a bus lane was made along Rebouças Avenue. It was the result of an infrastructure project linking the three 1960s neighbourhoods Alto de Pinheiros – Pinheiros – Butantã and innovating the space with more urban mobility for the poor. There were protests against the exclusive bus lane by the proprietors, because shop owners and residents said it would deeply mark the ugliness of a public means of transportation to transport people going to the region to work¹⁵.

The referring urban policies were idealised to meet the needs of the upper middle classes. São Paulo, its history and the housing construction from a structural perspective tend to be really selective¹⁶. Nowadays, the city invests in massive infrastructure projects to meet means of transportation need for an urban metropolis of 22 million people, housing and sanitary conditions. However, the costs of these investments are too high and even the interests of the public debt to promote them are over world rates¹⁷. Childcare and primary schools are educational areas in desperate situation because parents have to commute every day for at least three hours. The making of inner-land tenure for rich and affluent proprietors during the 1960s forged a very singular system of property in Brazil. Whether walled or not, there was a private condominium concept supported by social codes. The logic of the landlocked areas as a model of urban development inherits the spatial political design from the colonial architecture. The idea is the production of economic equality in an unequal society. These small principalities under the legal condition of properties were constructed on a total private conception, but highly political affluent in the central State. Lawful apparatuses

¹⁵ See <http://acervo.estadao.com.br/noticias/acervo,jardim-america-da-lama-ao-luxo,7201,0.htm>.

¹⁶ E. Maricato, *A Cidade de Pensamento Único*, Petrópolis 2002 and N. Bonduki, *Habitar São Paulo: Reflexões sobre a Gestão Urbana*, São Paulo 2000.

¹⁷ The average loan rates São Paulo State pays every year are approximately 6% plus a General Index Price (IGP-DI). The average in Japan is 1.2%, United States 3% and United Kingdom 0.5% for the long-term period 2011–2014. See the data available for the numbers on <http://bit.ly/1BcgTJO> page and the World Bank information on <http://bit.ly/1nzmckZ> page.

provided by the State were not necessarily effective in these neighbourhoods once the economic power of their proprietors was extremely decisive¹⁸.

2.2. PERIPHERY, FUNCTIONAL LANDLOCKED AREAS AND WARSAW'S OUTER RINGS

The history of Warsaw and the Communist Era may lead us to a different analysis of a singular type of functionality. For questions of methodology and purpose of the present article, we use some post-Socialist political regime facts. Up to a certain extent, functional models of urban planning show us the same two variables we have mentioned before in action since the second part of the 1990s. Housing construction, the phenomenon of suburbs and heavy inputs of capital in city projects for two decades suggest some considerations¹⁹.

The first of our observations starts with some parallels drawn between the district of Ursynów in Warsaw and what we previously defined as functionality. Polish experts highlight the process of suburbanisation and the lack of infrastructure as the main city challenges involving space and transformation. They say “(…), already in the second part of the 1990s, the housing construction began to expand in the direction of the southern borders of the district. As these areas had been used only for agricultural purposes, the investors were aware of a total lack of any infrastructure there. It was mainly the new Metro line that ‘opened’ that area for investors and helped to overcome their lack of enthusiasm for plots with no technical infrastructure. The boom which began at that time has in fact been lasting until now”²⁰. Nonetheless, the construction of highways, underground and basic sanitary conditions to set up innovative urban policies required massive quantities of monetary funds that the Polish did not have at their disposal. The solution was the modernisation of city economies through public debt strategy.

2.3. PUBLIC DEBT: LESSONS FROM WARSAW TO SÃO PAULO

The following table shows us the debt ratios in many aspects. Yet a common topic between the two cities, the Polish were aware of such perilous path during the 1990s. Is the public debt a real credit for all people in cities taking into consideration long-periods? We call attention to the current revenue line and the

¹⁸ E. Marques, *Estrutura Social e Segregação em São Paulo: Transformações na Década de 2000*, Revista de Ciências Sociais 2014, Vol. 57, No. 3, pp. 675–710.

¹⁹ *The Spatial Development of Warsaw Metropolitan Area Comments on “Warsaw Development Strategy until the Year 2010”* prepared for the World Bank by Alain and Marie Agnes Berated, June 11, 2000, revised December 2000.

²⁰ A. Gąsior-Niemiec, G. Glasze, D. Lippok, R. Pütz, *Gating a City: the Case of Warsaw*, Regional and Local Studies, Special Issue 2009, pp. 78–101.

level of interests. Despite numbers positive trends, the costs of modernising the country implies urban policies under indebted status. The construction of means of communication, such as underground and tram, implies high costs related to electricity, logistics and management. Since the national economy is dependent on important expertise, raw materials, knowledge and technologies, the city economy becomes naturally indebted. We could multiply municipal complex tasks if we postulate local governments are not isolate from other urban areas. It is curiously a city domino effect.

Table

Debt Ratios (%)

	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012
			actual		
Increase in liabilities total (y/y)	-0.7	78	31.4	12.8	-4.5
Share of debt in foreign currency	1.0	20.9	15.3	15.1	14.5
Total liabilities/Total revenue	22.0	39.8	50.6	52.8	47.7
Total liabilities/Current revenue	23.6	41.7	53.7	57.5	54.2
Total liabilities/Operating surplus	194.8	999.9	1583.90	2408.3	6912.1
Debt servicing/Total revenue	5.7	3.4	4.1	4.8	4.7
Debt servicing/Current revenue	6.1	3.5	4.3	5.2	5.3
Interests/Current revenue	1.3	1.2	2.1	3.0	3.3

The *Annual Report of the Issuer for 2014*, p. 10, Capital City of Warsaw, 30 April 2013. See <http://bit.ly/1gRahLu>

The *Annual Report of the Issuer for 2014* tells us that the determining variables for such expenses and debts are mainly the ones linked to infrastructure and urbanistic models. Particularly the case of Warsaw, the debt level is originated from the functional ideology of what cities should be. Warsaw has been revitalised for few, but its spatial transformation reveals places where massive investments in urban construction are applied. The costs of an immense city transformation to make landlocked areas viable are collectivised, but unfortunately the assets privatised: so, “Poland’s capital Warsaw illustrates how fiscal issues and infrastructure are managed at the level of a big city (...) Most Warsaw’s investment has been financed by long-term loans on floating interest rates” (Ners, 2007, p.174). The city of São Paulo curiously presents similar strategies to make the urban space a more modern one. The following graph has two functions. The ascending curve represents the municipal public debt and the lower one the payment of it²¹.

Most landlocked areas were constructed in the south of Warsaw where no infrastructure existed, but just open fields combined with farmlands. The concept

²¹ See http://www.tcm.sp.gov.br/painelnoticias/principal/2013/11_13Dissei.html.

was rapidly seen by developers and urbanistic strategists as a marketable idea. The traditional city of Łódź, southwest of Warsaw, is another example in Poland of selective infrastructural development and the collective costs drained by private enterprises. In Warsaw, walled residential areas mushroomed in various zones such as Bielany in the northwest²², which was a working-class neighbourhood during the U.S.S.R. period. The three landlocked areas of Gdańsk, Sopot and Gdynia are very illustrative with a synthesis of outer rings, infrastructure and public debt²³.

There is no evident connection to what kind of urban city the Varsovian citizenship objectively desires and the citizens who receive the benefits. We read such pointless seduction as a repulsive response from the Polish to a Socialist era, but at the same time the idea of privileges and prestige inherited from the high *strata* of the Communist era. The logic of political and economic power in the soul of the city is still alive as the complex symbology presented in the Palace of Culture and Science (1953). The delimitation of social classes is disguised by the discourse of a free society: “Therefore, the rapid spread of gated communities in Polish cities, especially in the capital city of Warsaw may be interpreted as a locally driven ‘exercise’ in the demarcation of social boundaries”. The reasons for such movement come also from those “distances by means of an ostentatious consumption of real estate products that are available in the Polish real estate market”²⁴. Prestige or stylish zones are desired by the same social *strata* that look for private property city detachment inside the same urban matrix²⁵.

3. UNKNOWNABLE LANDLOCKED AREAS IN SÃO PAULO AND WARSAW

Returning to countryside areas is generally interpreted as an alternative for the tiring way of life in modern urban contexts. It is mainly understood as a possibility in escaping from peoples’ animosity in urban contexts, low standards in quality life and relatively high prices for food. However, the move-outs to the

²² M. Górczyńska, *Specificity of gated neighbourhoods in the Bielany district (Warsaw)*, Journal of Urban Research 2012, No. 8.

²³ D. Polanska, *The emergence of gated communities in post-communist urban context: and the reasons for their increasing popularity*, Journal of the Housing and the Built Environment 2010, No. 25, pp. 295–312.

²⁴ A. Gąsior-Niemiec, G. Glasze, D. Lippok, R. Pütz, *Gating a City...*, p. 81.

²⁵ A. Mattissek, *Discursive Konstitution von Sicherheit im öffentlichen Raum am Beispiel Frankfurt am Main*, (in:) G. Glasze, R. Pütz, M. Rolfes (eds.), *Diskurs-Stadt-Kriminalität. Städtische (Un-)Sicherheiten aus der Perspektive von Stadtforschung und Kriminalgeographie*, Bielefeld 2005.

outer rings from central areas are not an exclusive phenomenon of our age. Dominated by his curiosity and adventurous spirit in London at the very beginning of the XX century, a North-American travelling journalist observed that the richest city in Europe had in its surrounding entire poor communities²⁶. East London was out the perimeter of the capital, but it was where dwellers used to talk about their ceaseless work, mental illnesses and the reduced stamina in their bodies due to the constant stress getting on their nerves. In *The return of the native* and *Jude the obscure*, the English writer Thomas Hardy poses the conflict evolving the country and the city caused by the transformations of the capital and, consequently, the obliteration of small proprietors in rural communities. In a long-run process initiated with the enclosures during the second half of the XVIII, knowable communities disintegrated because they used to have lives in common socioeconomic bounds. In London's and Hardy's writings, property system under the spatial marketable transformation stimulated the making of modern barony, economic contrasts and social otherness.

The brief analysis we suggest in the present article is devoted to the idea of landlocked areas in São Paulo and Warsaw, not necessarily gated communities. For us, the concept of community as a long-lasting experience in people consciousness and human experiences is far beyond the daily life routine. It is not deniable there are elements of social class grammar in terms of values and language in knowable communities. Some XVIII-XIX novelists including Jane Austen and George Eliot extensively documented such cultural and material interests among families and the curiosity for otherness²⁷. Nevertheless, the idea of being socially tagged demands the existence of a community. If there is no identity, based on cultural and economic criteria, the fellowship sentiment disappears in essence and it seems to be much more an apparent phenomenon. The city logic tends to diminish in that sense the concept of knowable communities. Labour, private life and family safety have been colonised by the landlocked aesthetics using an unequal urban architectural grammar. Ursynów is just one more novel telling us the same story as we read in different local settings, narratives and characters

²⁶ "My first impression of East London (1903) was naturally a general one. Later the details began to appear, and here and there in the chaos of misery I found little spots where a fair measure of happiness reigned – sometimes whole of rows of houses in little out-of-the-way streets [periphery/segregation], where artisans dwell and where a rude sort of family life obtains" – p. 28; "I looked out of the window, which should have commanded the back yards of the neighbouring buildings. But there were no back yards, or, rather, they were covered with one-storey hovels, cowsheds, in which people lived. The roofs of these hovels were covered with deposits of filth, in some places a couple of feet deep – the contributions from the back windows of the second and third storeys. I could make out fish and meat bones, garbage, pestilential rags, old boots, broken earthenware, and all the general refuse of a human sty". See J. London, *The People of the Abyss*, Memphis 2012, p. 35.

²⁷ R. Williams, *The Country and the City*, Oxford 1973, pp. 165–181.

in global scale²⁸. This is why we do not use the definition of “gated communities” once the communion of a group does not rely on physical walls to make their internal rules exist as some authors affirm²⁹. A prison is a place for criminals, but the illicit community will not disappear if the walls fall down. The same a religious circle that does not need a church or a temple to keep their beliefs alive. In the case of landlocked areas, even under the market forces of consumerism and selective urban policies, if the physical division disappears they will not feel the same prestige and socioeconomic exclusivism.

In terms of law, landlocked areas reassumes the right to private life under the system of what could be called transversal property law. Condominiums seem to be the same in global urban cities. Morumbi, Barueri, Bielany, Gdańsk, Sopot, Gdynia and Łódź have different names and countries, but the logic of sharing an area derives from economic unconscious *fetiches*. In the original projects sold by the constructors, nobody is invited to know each other and families preserve the right to be an island. It could be the paradise of a high rational micro-society with sophisticated understanding about physical limits in the private neighbourhood, use of common areas and the financial contribution of each to keep the setting of housing units organised. However, such architecture and permissive urban policies based on (re)constructive ideologies hide the disarticulation of a political community in demanding more rights. The capital invested in these landlocked areas nurtures the consumerist desire of citizens as a way to impose their own fulfilment in making profits using methods of geographical inequality³⁰. Moreover, all the aspiration for the public space and healthy life is reduced to infrastructural strategies such as highways, means of transportation, safety and commuting challenges. It is a way to minimise or annihilate as some authors would say the idea of public, space and people³¹. Probably the most affluent socioeconomic *strata* living in landlocked areas prefer the car to open green areas, prestige to communities, isolation to walking to work.

In São Paulo, it is hard to imagine an upper middle class resident from a gated private zone going out of their comfort belt once they feel vulnerable to criminals, kidnapping and beggars. In Warsaw, yet the social and urban agenda does not face such problems, the transformation of the city is under the same effect of what we observe in São Paulo. The urban functionality is a guideline in both cities since the urbanistic model results in more socioeconomic segregation and administra-

²⁸ J. Gądecki, *Gating Warsaw: Enclosed Housing Estates and the Aesthetics of the Luxury*, (in:) M. Grubbauer, J. Kusiak (eds.), *Chasing Warsaw: Social Material Dynamics of Urban Change Since 1990*, Frankfurt 2012, pp. 109–132.

²⁹ S. Blandy, *Gated communities in England as a response to crime and disorder: context, effectiveness and implications*, People, Place & Policy Online 2007, No. 1/2, pp. 47–48 and R. Atkinson, S. Blandy, J. Flint, D. Lister, *Gated Communities in England*, London 2004.

³⁰ M. Purcell, *Excavating Lefebvre...*

³¹ D. Mitchell, *The Annihilation of Space by Law: the Roots and Implications of anti-homeless laws in the United States*, Antipode 1997, Vol. 3, No. 29.

tive micro-zones inside neighbourhoods. Panic, phobias, mental disorders and depression in São Paulo and Warsaw are linked to these kinds of city models also as studies show us³².

4. MUNICIPAL PUBLIC DEBT AND THE LAWFUL PARAMETER

In Brazil, the legislation to slow down the eagerness of mayors in abusing of the public debt is known as the 2000 Federal Fiscal Responsibility Act (FFRA) or *Lei da Responsabilidade Fiscal* 101/00, which was approved based on the Intent VI, Article 52 of the 1988 Brazilian Federal Constitution. The resolutions 40 and 43 affirm that the municipal limit for public indebtedness shall be 1.2 times the city liquid budget³³. It means that after Brazilian municipalities meeting their financial responsibilities with employees, suppliers and all public services the remainder is the calculus basis. It is almost intuitive that the Brazilian cities set yearly rising goals in applying taxes, fees and fines to make higher positive differ-

³² Jan Czesław Czabala, Institute of Psychiatry and Neurology, Warsaw; Bohdan Dudek, Institute of Occupational Medicine; Lodz Piotr Krasucki, Specialist Emeritus in Occupational Medicine, Warsaw; Bożena Pietrzykowska Institute of Psychiatry and Neurology, Warsaw; Włodzimirz Brodniak, Institute of Psychiatry and Neurology, Warsaw, prepared a study to analyse the challenges around psychological problems in Poland linked to workplace, productivity and city life. As the report says “The impact of mental health problems in the workplace has serious consequences not only for the individuals whose lives are influenced either directly or indirectly, but also for enterprise productivity. Mental health problems strongly influence employee performance, rates of illnesses, absenteeism, accidents, and staff turnover”. The report affirms yet that the “New standards of psychiatric treatment suggest that the basic venue for caring for the mentally ill should be the community and the major goal of psychiatric care should be improving the quality of life of patients with chronic mental health disorders. There has been a significant reduction of beds in the large psychiatric hospitals. Small psychiatric wards are being opened in general hospitals, which are more accessible to patients’ homes; and mobile community teams, day treatment hospitals, and sheltered workshops have been established. Within the framework of community psychiatric care, associations of patients, their families, and friends have been organised and are having an impact on decisions taken by local and central governments. The associations have promoted the treatment of patients in their own communities, raised funds, helped find jobs, apartments etc. Rapid crisis intervention centres have been opened to deal with the sudden onset of psychological problems”. See International Labour Organization (ILO), *Mental Health in Workplace: Situation Analysis in Poland*, 2000, pp. 1–4, at <http://bit.ly/1KfCxyH>. About mental disorders and urban contexts, read the article written by M. Bobak, H. Pikhart, A. Pająk, R. Kubinova, S. Malyutina, H. Sebakova, R. Topor-Madry, Y. Nikitin, M. Marmot, *Depressive Symptoms in Urban Population Samples in Russia, Poland and the Czech Republic*, British Journal of Psychiatry 2006, No. 188, pp. 359–365. See also L. H. Andrade, Y.-P. Wang, S. Andreoni, C. M. Silveira, C. Alexandrino-Silva, E.R. Siu, *Mental Disorders in Megacities: Findings from the São Paulo Megacity Mental Health Survey*, Brazil 2012.

³³ These resolutions were passed by the Senate in 2001 as the Article 30 of FFRA affirms.

ences. In 2012, the revenue of the city was around 34 billion Reais and the debt 53 billion³⁴. The fiscal responsibility in both cases has stimulated the opposite. With the excuse of being cautious, São Paulo and Warsaw started working on the limit and being more and more indebted.

In the Polish case, the public debt increased steadily from 42% in 1999 to 53.4% of the GDP in 2010. Although the Polish control since the end of the Soviet Union, the financial authorities knew they had to pay higher interest rates to create a more attractive and speculative conjuncture. They concomitantly passed the 2000 Budget Statute to prevent them from fiscal irresponsibility and make sure the government's actions would be stoppable when 55% of the nominal GDP reached³⁵. The 1997 Constitution of the Republic of Poland, Chapter X, Public Finances, Article 216.5 says "It shall be neither permissible to contract loans nor provide guarantees and financial sureties which would engender a national public debt exceeding three-fifths of the value of the annual gross domestic product". As Adam Reichard affirms "(...) if the public debt reaches above 55% of the GDP, legal requirements force Polish officials to begin automatic cuts in public spending". Nonetheless, the author continues saying that "Poland also saw continued growth and investment in infrastructure investments across local communities (...)"³⁶.

The legislators and the policy makers are trapped by a present insolvable debt and they still resist in such logic insisting on rapid city modernisation, but combined with more inequality in a long-run. Landlocked areas and urban policies inspired in exclusivist physical city transformation reduce the public space for many and impose a disguised private logic. Poland and Brazil uses such property architecture to promote security, socioeconomic status, prestige and global cities. It seems to be a very complex issue, but we could use the legal possibility of being indebted with other purposes. If we substitute massive centre-periphery infrastructure allied to suburbanisation policies to human capital investments through house construction, we are able to provide solid productive citizenships. We use the definition of Radical Housing Network Organisation about decent homes to ventilate the possibilities of a more socioeconomic development: "A decent home should be physically comfortable; be secure; have access to schools; work; health-care; cultural facilities; transport; fresh affordable food and green space; allow people to have control over their indoor and outdoor environment; be genuinely affordable, allow people to develop communities and support each other". As they say, they reject the policy of marketable housing through "rising costs of housing;

³⁴ Just to have an idea, divide by 3.3 to approximately calculate in U.S. Dollars. See <http://bit.ly/1KsgCEG>.

³⁵ Read the *Annual Report, Polish Treasure Security*, 1999, pp. 12–13. See <http://bit.ly/1W-waBQD> and the Polish Ministry of Finance documents on <http://bit.ly/1J9vMhc>.

³⁶ A. Reichard, *Poland and the Global Economic Crisis: Observations and Reflections in the Public Sector*, Journal of Finance and Management in Public Services 2011, Vol. 10, No. 1, p. 44.

sell-off of council housing; encouragement of profiteering, speculation and buy-to-let; increase in overcrowding and street homelessness; destruction of housing coops; and other social housing solutions; criminalisation of squatting; welfare reform policies; reduction of security; increasing eviction and displacement; empty homes; decreasing quality of housing; gentrification and displacement³⁷.

5. CONCLUSION

A proto-right to the city starts with decent homes for all as primary and urgent urban policies. Our present discussion incentivises those urban possibilities committed to effective scales, because houses and infrastructure are supposed to serve mainly the most vulnerable in the city. It is very important to remember that the right to the city concept was presented by Henri Lefebvre's book during the very end of the 1960s. The French philosopher idealised the concept linked to urban matters under the umbrella of the decision-making process idea and how collectives could take part of the public spaces. It was a period when Marxist reviewers debated original routes to face politically the capital revivals two decades after the post-World War II era. He pointed out the public space as an arena of political and economic disputes involving decision-making process, construction sectors, speculating plans of urbanism and legislators fragmenting politically the working class demand. The right to the city was a utopian vision of a future totality on which would be founded the philosophical principles to put people in the core of the political urban life³⁸. Landlocked areas promote structural and social divisions, divides the city and generates endless public debts.

SÃO PAULO, WARSAW AND LANDLOCKED AREAS: FROM FUNCTIONALITY TO PROTO-RIGHT TO THE CITY

Summary

São Paulo and Warsaw are undoubtedly different cities. Nevertheless, they both have critical issues and common uncertainties. Challenges involving means of transportation, lack of coordination in integrating neighbourhoods and scarce funds to meet their wishes

³⁷ See <http://bit.ly/1E1JRkA>.

³⁸ H. Lefebvre, *Le droit à la ville*, Paris 2009, pp. 13–14.

in modernising their space are some of them. In recent years, they have expanded their urban policies using public indebtedness as an economic political solution. The aim of this article is the discussion of such a strategy as a selective apparatus promoting places for few in these two vibrant capitals. Landlocked areas and petty bourgeoisie zones usually drain the Varsovian and Paulistano public revenues once they are seen as the unique possibility of bringing rapidly massive investments to cities. The methodology of our analysis relies on a critical comment to lawful possibilities in using the public debt to promote centre-periphery infrastructure through extremely limited circles of decision-makers and functional city planning.

SÃO PAULO, WARSZAWA I TERENY WYDZIELONE: OD FUNKCJONALNOŚCI DO PROTO-PRAWA DO MIASTA

Streszczenie

São Paulo i Warszawa to miasta niewątpliwie się różniące. Mimo to mają swoje wspólne ważne, trudno rozwiązywalne problemy. Wyzwania takie jak środki komunikacji, brak skoordynowanej integracji przedmieść i nikłe fundusze na realizację planów modernizacyjnych – to tylko niektóre ze wspólnych problemów. W ostatnich latach miasta te rozszerzyły swą politykę urbanizacyjną, korzystając z zadłużenia publicznego jako ekonomiczno-politycznego rozwiązania. Celem niniejszego artykułu jest omówienie powyższej strategii jako selektywnej metody promującej rozwój dzielnic tylko dla najbogatszych. Zamknięte i „nowobogackie” osiedla zwykle korzystają na przychodach podatkowych, które są postrzegane jako możliwość wprowadzenia nowych inwestycji do miast. Metodologia naszych badań polega na krytycznym komentarzu prawnych możliwości wykorzystania długu publicznego do rozwoju centro-peryferijnej infrastruktury miejskiej przez bardzo ograniczone kręgi polityczne i funkcjonalnego planowania urbanizacyjnego.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Andrade L. H., Wang Y.-P., Andreoni S., Silveira C. M., Alexandrino-Silva C., Siu E.R., *Mental Disorders in Megacities: Findings from the São Paulo Megacity Mental Health Survey*, Brazil 2012
- Atkinson R., Blandy S., Flint J., Lister D., *Gated Communities in England*, London 2004
- Blandy S., *Gated communities in England as a response to crime and disorder: context, effectiveness and implications*, People, Place & Policy Online 2007, No.1/2

- Bobak M., Pikhart H., Pająk A., Kubinova R., Malyutina S., Sebakova H., Topor-Madry R., Nikitin Y., Marmot M., *Depressive Symptoms in Urban Population Samples in Russia, Poland and the Czech Republic*, British Journal of Psychiatry 2006, No. 188
- Bonduki N., *Habitar São Paulo: Reflexões sobre a Gestão Urbana*, São Paulo 2000
- Dias E., *The Citizen who Stood Up to the Bankers*, (in:) *What is Occupy? Inside the Global Movement*, New York 2011
- Freyre G., *Sobrados e Mucambos*, São Paulo 2003
- Gądecki J., *Gating Warsaw: Enclosed Housing Estates and the Aesthetics of the Luxury*, (in:) Grubbauer M., Kusiak J. (eds.), *Chasing Warsaw: Social Material Dynamics of Urban Change Since 1990*, Frankfurt 2012
- Gąsior-Niemiec A., Glasze G., Lippok D., Pütz R., *Gating a City: the Case of Warsaw*, Regional and Local Studies, Special Issue 2009
- Górczyńska M., *Specificity of gated neighbourhoods in the Bielany district (Warsaw)*, Journal of Urban Research 2012, No. 8
- Grubbauer M., Kusiak J. (eds.), *Chasing Warsaw: Social Material Dynamics of Urban Change Since 1990*, Frankfurt 2012
- Harvey D., *Rebel Cities: from the Right to the City to the Urban Revolution*, London 2012
- Jacquot H., Priet F., *Droit de l'urbanisme*, Paris 2004
- Lefebvre H., *Le droit à la ville*, Paris 2009
- Leslie R. F., *The History of Poland since 1863*, Cambridge 1980
- London J., *The People of the Abyss*, Memphis 2012
- Maricato E., *A Cidade de Pensamento Único*, Petrópolis 2002
- Marques E., *Estrutura Social e Segregação em São Paulo: Transformações na Década de 2000*, Revista de Ciências Sociais 2014, Vol. 57, No. 3
- Mattissek A., *Discursive Konstitution von Sicherheit im öffentlichen Raum am Beispiel Frankfurt am Main*, (in:) G. Glasze, R. Pütz, M. Rolfes (eds.), *Diskurs-Stadt-Kriminalität. Stadtische (Un-) Sicherheiten aus der Perspektive von Stadtforschung und Kriminalgeographie*, Bielefeld 2005
- Mitchell D., *The Annihilation of Space by Law: the Roots and Implications of Anti-homeless Laws in the United States*, Antipode 1997, Vol. 3, No. 29
- Ners K., *Infrastructure Development in Poland: the Issues at Stake*, (in:) G. E. Peterson, P. Clark Annez (eds.), *Financing Cities: Fiscal Responsibility and Urban Infrastructure in Brazil. China, India, Poland and South Africa*, New Delhi 2007
- Pessoa L. C., Bogus L., *Operações urbanas – nova forma de incorporação imobiliária: o caso das Operações Urbanas Consorciadas Faria Lima e Água Espraiada*, Cader-nos Metrôpole 2008, No. 20
- Polanska D., *The emergence of gated communities in post-communist urban context: and the reasons for their increasing popularity*, Journal of the Housing and the Built Environment 2010, No. 25
- Purcell M., *Excavating Lefebvre: the right to the city and its urban politics of the inhabitant*, GeoJournal 2002, No. 58
- Reichard A., *Poland and the Global Economic Crisis: Observations and Reflections in the Public Sector*, Journal of Finance and Management in Public Services 2011, Vol. 10, No. 1

- Rolnik R., *Afterword – Place, inhabitation and citizenship: the right to housing and the right to the city in the contemporary urban world*, International Journal of Housing Policy 2014, No. 3 (14)
- Rosenberd D., *Rebel Footprints: A Guide to Uncovering London's Radical History*, London 2015
- Ryan A., *On Marx*, London 2014
- Scherer M., *Introduction: Taking it to the Streets*, (in:) *What is Occupy? Inside the Global Movement*, New York 2011
- Souza M. L., *Which right to which city?, In defence of political-strategic clarity*, Interface: a journal for and about social movements 2010, No. 1 (2)
- Taschner S. P., Bogus L. M., *São Paulo: o caleidoscópio urbano*, São Paulo Perspectiva 2001, Vol. 15, No. 1
- Williams R., *The Country and the City*, Oxford 1973

KEYWORDS

landlocked areas, gated communities, public indebtedness, proto-right to the city and urban policies

SŁOWA KLUCZOWE

obszary bez dostępu do morza, osiedla strzeżone, zadłużenie publiczne, prawo naturalne do miasta, polityka urbanistyczna